

FOX ROTHSCHILD LLP

Karen A. Confoy  
Thomas A. Cunniff  
Christopher R. Kinkade  
997 Lenox Drive, Bldg 3  
Lawrenceville, New Jersey 08648  
(609) 844-3033 (Telephone)/(609) 896-1469 (Facsimile)  
kconfoy@foxrothschild.com

KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP

Jay R. Deshmukh  
William R. Zimmerman  
Andrea L. Cheek  
1717 Pennsylvania Avenue, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20006  
(202) 640-6400 (Telephone)/(202) 640-6401 (Facsimile)  
jay.deshmukh@knobbe.com  
bill.zimmerman@knobbe.com  
andrea.cheek@knobbe.com

KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP

Thomas P. Krzeminski  
William O. Adams  
Karen M. Cassidy  
2040 Main Street, 14th Floor  
Irvine, CA 92614  
(949) 760-0404 (Telephone)/(949) 760-9502 (Facsimile)  
thomas.krzeminski@knobbe.com  
william.adams@knobbe.com  
karen.cassidy@knobbe.com  
*Attorneys for Defendants Wockhardt USA LLC and Wockhardt Ltd.*

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION, NOVARTIS  
CORPORATION, and NOVARTIS AG,  
Plaintiffs,

v.

WOCKHARDT USA LLC and  
WOCKHARDT LIMITED,  
Defendants.

C.A. No. 2 :12-cv-03967-SDW-MCA

Motion Day : May 21, 2013

---

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION, NOVARTIS  
CORPORATION, and NOVARTIS AG

Plaintiffs,

v.

SUN PHARMA GLOBAL FZE and SUN  
PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRIES  
LIMITED,

Defendants.

---

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION,

Plaintiff,

v.

ACTAVIS LLC; APOTEX, INC.;  
APOTEX, CORP.; GLAND PHARMA  
LTD.; DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES,  
INC.; DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES  
LTD.; EMCURE PHARMACEUTICALS  
USA, INC.; EMCURE  
PHARMACEUTICALS, LTD; HOSPIRA,  
INC.; PHARMACEUTICS  
INTERNATIONAL INC.; SAGENT  
PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.; ACS  
DOBFAR INFO S.A.; STRIDES, INC.;  
AGILA SPECIALTIES PRIVATE LTD.;  
SUN PHARMA GLOBAL FZE;  
CARACO PHARMACEUTICAL  
LABORATORIES, LTD; SUN  
PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRIES  
LTD.; WOCKHARDT USA LLC; and  
WOCKHARDT LTD.

Defendants.

---

C.A. No. 2:12-cv-04394-SDW-MCA

Motion Day : May 21, 2013

C.A. No. 2:13-cv-1028-SDW-MCA

Motion Day : May 21, 2013

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION,

Plaintiff,

v.

ACCORD HEALTHCARE INC.;  
FRESENIUS KABI USA, LLC; and  
HIKMA FARMACEUTICA S.A.,

Defendants.

C.A. No. 2:13-cv-2379-SDW-MCA

Motion Day : May 21, 2013

**DECLARATION OF KAREN A. CONFOY IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS  
WOCKHARDT USA, LLC AND WOCKHARDT LTD.'S OPPOSITION TO  
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE**

I, KAREN A. CONFOY, hereby declare as follows:

1. I am counsel for Defendants Wockhardt USA LLC and Wockhardt Limited (collectively "Wockhardt") in the above-captioned civil action nos. 2:12-03967 (SDW/MCA) and 2:13-01028 (SDW/MCA). I submit this declaration in support of Wockhardt's Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Consolidate.

2. I am an attorney at law admitted to practice before the United States District Court for the District of New Jersey. I am a partner at Fox Rothschild, LLP. Unless otherwise stated, the facts set forth in this declaration are true and of my own personal knowledge, and, if called upon to do so, I could and would testify competently to them.

3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 1** is a true and correct copy of Novartis's Disclosure of Asserted Claims, in C.A. No. 2:12-cv-03967-SDW-MCA, served on October 12, 2012.

4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 2** is a true and correct copy of emails between Thomas F. Lavery, IV, counsel of record for Sun; William O. Adams, counsel of record for Wockhardt;

and Sadaf A. Abdullah, counsel of record for Novartis, sent on April 8, 2013, agreeing to a claim construction for the final disputed claim term in the '241 patent.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: April 30, 2013

/s/ Karen A. Confoy  
Karen A. Confoy  
kconfoy@foxrothschild.com

Counsel for Wockhardt USA LLC and  
Wockhardt Limited

# **EXHIBIT 1**

William J. O'Shaughnessy  
MCCARTER & ENGLISH LLP  
Four Gateway Center  
100 Mulberry Street  
Newark, NJ 07102  
(973) 639-2094  
woshaughnessy@mccarter.com

*Attorneys for Novartis Pharmaceuticals  
Corporation, Novartis Corporation, and  
Novartis AG*

OF COUNSEL:

Robert J. Gunther, Jr.  
Jane M. Love  
Sadaf R. Abdullah  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR LLP  
399 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
(212) 230-8800

Lisa J. Pirozzolo  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR LLP  
60 State Street  
Boston, MA 02109  
(617) 526-6000

*Attorneys for Novartis Pharmaceuticals  
Corporation, Novartis Corporation, and Novartis  
AG*

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

---

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION, NOVARTIS  
CORPORATION, and NOVARTIS AG

Plaintiffs,

v.

WOCKHARDT USA LLC and  
WOCKHARDT LIMITED

Defendants.

---

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

)

Civil Action No. 2:12-cv-03967-SDW-MCA

**PLAINTIFFS' DISCLOSURE OF ASSERTED CLAIMS PURSUANT TO  
NEW JERSEY LOCAL PATENT RULE 3.6(b)**

Pursuant to Local Patent Rule 3.6(b), Plaintiffs Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation, Novartis Corporation, and Novartis AG (collectively, "Plaintiffs"), provide the following Disclosure of Asserted Claims relating to United States Patent No. 7,932,241 (the "'241 patent").

This disclosure is based on the information presently available to Plaintiffs. Plaintiffs reserve the right to supplement or amend this disclosure in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules as they obtain additional information. Plaintiffs assert that, at this time, and based upon the information contained in Defendants' ANDA Nos. 203070 and 203989, Defendants have infringed, continue to infringe, and/or will infringe claims 1, 2, 3, 4, 8, 9, 11, 21, 22, 23, 24, and 25 of the '241 patent.

Plaintiffs reserve the right to revise and or supplement this disclosure as discovery progresses and Plaintiffs' investigation continues, and as more information becomes available.

Dated: October 12, 2012

/s/ Sadaf R. Abdullah  
William J. O'Shaughnessy  
MCCARTER & ENGLISH LLP  
Four Gateway Center  
100 Mulberry Street  
Newark, NJ 07102  
(973) 639-2094  
woshaughnessy@mccarter.com

*Attorneys for Novartis Pharmaceuticals  
Corporation, Novartis Corporation, and  
Novartis AG*

OF COUNSEL:

Robert J. Gunther, Jr.  
Jane M. Love  
Sadaf R. Abdullah  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR LLP  
399 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
(212) 230-8800  
robert.gunther@wilmerhale.com  
jane.love@wilmerhale.com  
sadaf.abdullah@wilmerhale.com

Lisa J. Pirozzolo  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR LLP  
60 State Street  
Boston, MA 02109  
(617) 526-6000  
lisa.pirozzolo@wilmerhale.com

*Attorneys for Novartis Pharmaceuticals  
Corporation, Novartis Corporation, and Novartis  
AG*



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that all counsel of record are being served via electronic mail and U.S. Mail with a copy of the foregoing Plaintiffs' Disclosure of Asserted Claims Pursuant to New Jersey Local Patent Rule 3.6(b) on October 12, 2012.

/s/ Sadaf R. Abdullah  
Sadaf R. Abdullah

# **EXHIBIT 2**

---

**From:** Lavery, Thomas [mailto:TLavery@kenyon.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, April 08, 2013 8:12 AM  
**To:** Abdullah, Sadaf; Love, Jane; Gunther, Jr., Robert J.; WOshaughnessy@McCarter.com; Pirozzolo, Lisa; Gu, Henry  
**Cc:** Confoy, Karen A.; Jay.Deshmukh; 2Woa; Karen.Cassidy; Thomas.Krzeminski; Bill.Zimmerman; Sun-Zoledronic-Acid  
**Subject:** Novartis v. Wockhardt (12-3967) - Claim Construction

Dear Counsel,

After a meet-and-confer today between Sun and Novartis on the construction of "plastic material," Sun agrees to Novartis's proposed construction of "plastic material" in U.S. Patent No. 7,932,241 as "any of various organic compounds produced by polymerization and capable of being molded, extruded, cast into shapes and films."

Based on this agreement, Sun understands that Item Nos. 5-11 of the December 21, 2012 Scheduling Order (Dkt. No. 43) are moot.

Best regards,  
Tom

**Thomas F. Lavery, IV**  
**Kenyon & Kenyon LLP**  
One Broadway | New York, NY 10004-1007  
212.908.6379 Phone | 212.425.5288 Fax  
[tlavery@kenyon.com](mailto:tlavery@kenyon.com) | [www.kenyon.com](http://www.kenyon.com)

---

This message, including any attachments, may contain confidential, attorney-client privileged, attorney work product, or business confidential information, and is only for the use of the intended recipient(s). Any review, use or distribution by others is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

---

**From:** William.Adams [mailto:William.Adams@knobbe.com]  
**Sent:** Friday, April 05, 2013 12:53 PM  
**To:** Abdullah, Sadaf; Love, Jane; Gunther, Jr., Robert J.; WOshaughnessy@McCarter.com; Pirozzolo, Lisa; Gu, Henry  
**Cc:** Confoy, Karen A.; Jay.Deshmukh; 2Woa; Karen.Cassidy; Thomas.Krzeminski; Lavery, Thomas; Bill.Zimmerman  
**Subject:** RE: Novartis v. Wockhardt (12-3967) - Identification Evidence in Support of Preliminary Claim Constructions

Counsel,

After a meet and confer today between Wockhardt and Novartis regarding the construction of the "plastic material" term, Wockhardt agrees to Novartis's proposed construction of "plastic material" in the '241 patent as "any of various organic compounds produced by polymerization and capable of being molded, extruded, cast into shapes and films."

Regards,  
William

**William Adams**

Associate  
William.Adams@knobbe.com  
949-721-5261 Direct

**Knobbe Martens**

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW

**five decades. one focus.**

2040 Main Street, 14th Floor  
Irvine, CA 92614  
www.knobbe.com/william-adams

---

**From:** Abdullah, Sadaf [<mailto:Sadaf.Abdullah@wilmerhale.com>]

**Sent:** Monday, April 01, 2013 6:02 PM

**To:** William.Adams; Love, Jane; Gunther, Jr., Robert J.; [WOshaughnessy@McCarter.com](mailto:WOshaughnessy@McCarter.com); Pirozzolo, Lisa; Gu, Henry

**Cc:** Confoy, Karen A.; Jay.Deshmukh; 2Woa; Karen.Cassidy; Thomas.Krzeminski; [tlavery@kenyon.com](mailto:tlavery@kenyon.com)

**Subject:** RE: Novartis v. Wockhardt (12-3967) - Identification Evidence in Support of Preliminary Claim Constructions

Counsel,

Attached please find Novartis's Proposed Claim Constructions and Supporting Evidence For Claim Terms of the '241 Patent. Novartis is also prepared to meet and confer with Wockhardt and exchange evidence relating to its proposed claim construction related to the '987 patent claims. If Wockhardt wishes to proceed, please propose a time for the meet and confer.

Novartis's L. Pat. R. 4.2(b) production will follow.

Regards,  
Sadaf

---

**From:** William.Adams [<mailto:William.Adams@knobbe.com>]

**Sent:** Monday, April 01, 2013 8:59 PM

**To:** Abdullah, Sadaf; Love, Jane; Gunther, Jr., Robert J.; [WOshaughnessy@McCarter.com](mailto:WOshaughnessy@McCarter.com); Pirozzolo, Lisa; Gu, Henry

**Cc:** Confoy, Karen A.; [jay.deshmukh@knobbe.com](mailto:jay.deshmukh@knobbe.com); [2Woa@knobbe.com](mailto:2Woa@knobbe.com); [karen.cassidy@knobbe.com](mailto:karen.cassidy@knobbe.com); [Thomas.Krzeminski@knobbe.com](mailto:Thomas.Krzeminski@knobbe.com); [tlavery@kenyon.com](mailto:tlavery@kenyon.com)

**Subject:** Novartis v. Wockhardt (12-3967) - Identification Evidence in Support of Preliminary Claim Constructions

Counsel,

Attached please find Wockhardt's Identification of Evidence in Support of its Preliminary Proposed Claim Constructions.

Regards,  
William

**William Adams**

Associate  
William.Adams@knobbe.com  
949-721-5261 Direct

**Knobbe Martens**

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW

**five decades. one focus.**

2040 Main Street, 14th Floor  
Irvine, CA 92614

[www.knobbe.com/william-adams](http://www.knobbe.com/william-adams)

NOTICE: This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

NOTICE: This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.